President David Malpass The World Bank Group 1818 H Street NW, Washington, D.C. 20433

cc: Ethiopis Tafara Acting Vice President Integrity Vice Presidency The World Bank Group 1818 H Street NW, Washington, D.C. 20433

Dear President Malpass and INT Vice President Tafara,

We, the undersigned, are a collection of individuals and organizations who strive to promote religious freedom and human rights around the world. We would first like to express our gratitude to the World Bank for its leadership in providing assistance and aid to developing nations in order to encourage necessary economic and infrastructural improvement in such nations.

While keeping in mind the visible benefits and opportunities that the World Bank's development aid provides to hundreds of nations around the world, we would like to express our concern regarding the findings related to Eritrea contained in the February 2020 World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 9150, *Elite Capture of Foreign Aid: Evidence from Offshore Bank Accounts*.

This report examined whether there is a visible and verifiable correlation between receipt of foreign aid from the World Bank by certain countries, and money flows from these countries to foreign banks. A correlation would suggest that corrupt elites are capturing the aid and pocketing it rather than using it to develop their nation. This research found that "in a quarter where a country received aid equivalent to 1% of GDP, its deposits in havens [nations whose laws allow for secrecy regarding personal finances and private assets] increase by 3.4% relative to a country receiving no aid."

The policy paper determines that "aid disbursements are associated with wealth accumulation in offshore accounts," and that data leaks and tax documentation illustrate that such accounts are concentrated overwhelmingly "at the top of the wealth distribution," and therefore are owned by elites. Of greater interest, however, is the fact that Eritrea is one of the nations whose statistics reflect this corrupt phenomenon: in Eritrea, World Bank aid flows account for 3.2% of the annual GDP, the nation has 8 deposit accounts in foreign bank 'havens,' and it exhibits a 2.29% quarterly growth rate in deposits to foreign accounts.

We fear that the statistics raised in this policy paper reveal the extent to which corruption is an overwhelming political problem in Eritrea and, similarly, the extent to which the World Bank's aid to Eritrea is not being utilized for its intended purposes. It would be truly reprehensible if the funding provided by the World Bank to Eritrea for the purpose of development

is simply being stockpiled in overseas banking institutions by elites and corrupt government officials to fund their personal expenditures and prop-up the oppressive authoritarian regime.

Eritrea is one of, if not the most, repressive nations on the African continent, and is a repetitive perpetrator of human rights violations. The most noteworthy and deplorable of these violations includes arbitrary and indefinite detention with no access to legal counsel in overcrowded prison conditions; absence of freedom of speech and expression, and targeting of journalists; harassment and mass imprisonment of religious adherents, and closures of houses of worship; and the infamous program of indefinite military conscription and forced labor whereby the nation's citizens, both male and female, are compelled into lifelong careers that the government chooses for them regardless of their interests or qualifications, where they receive extremely insufficient wages and often experience substandard working conditions.

Eritrea is referred to by several human rights organizations as being 'the North Korea of Africa' due to its grave and comprehensive violations of civil, political, economic social and cultural rights. In 2016 a United Nations Commission of Inquiry concluded that crimes against humanity have been occurring in Eritrea since 1991.

In addition, Eritrea is consistently classified as highly corrupt by Transparency International, and was ranked the 21st most corrupt nation in the world in 2019. Such corruption hinders the advancement of the nation's citizens. Moreover, the 2017 Natural Resource Governance Index, which measures the governance standards of developing countries' extractive industries, ranks Eritrea in 89th place- dead last- and its state-owned mining company is categorized as the worst governed state enterprise.²

Given the well-documented concerns regarding the mismanagement of state funds, we collectively and respectfully make the following recommendations regarding the World Bank's future financial assistance to Eritrea:

- Either decrease with immediate effect aid transfers to Eritrea, pending improvements in the government's human rights record and transparency practices; or
- Consider ending the provision of large sums of aid to Eritrea;
- Stipulate mandatory monitoring and reporting mechanisms to ensure that World Bank foreign aid is used for its intended purposes of advancing economic and social development

Yours respectfully, and with great appreciation for your attention to these matters,

¹ Corruption Perceptions Index 2019 Results," Transparency International, available at: https://www.transparency.org/files/content/pages/2019 CPI Report EN.pdf [accessed 6 June 2020].

² National Resource Governance Institute, 2017 Resource Governance Index, 12 July 2017, available at: https://resourcegovernance.org/analysis-tools/publications/2017-resource-governance-index [accessed 11 June 2020].

Organizations

Bayto Yiakl France

Bayto Yiakl Switzerland

Bayto Yiakl UK

Bayto Yiakl USA

Christian Freedom International

Christian Solidarity Worldwide

ERISAT- Eritrean Satellite Television

Eritrea Focus

Europe External Programme with Africa

Freedom of Religion – United Solutions

Global Initiative to Empower Eritrean Grassroots Movement

Human Rights Concern- Eritrea

Human Rights Without Frontiers

Institute on Religion and Democracy

International Christian Foundation for Democracy

Jubilee Campaign USA

Love Your Neighbor Community

Minh Van Foundation

Save the Persecuted Christians

The America Team for Displaced Eritreans

Individuals

Rev. Joseph K. Grieboski Senior Fellow The Dietrich Bonhoeffer Institute

Scott Morgan President Red Eagle Enterprises

Faith J. H. McDonnell Anglican Persecuted Church Network

Dede Laugesen
Executive Director
Save the Persecuted Christian

Henry Thomas Jones IV, J. D. President International Christian Foundation for Democracy

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ilyas Chairman IDRAC International Dialogue Research & Awareness Centre

Dr. Jianli Yang Founder and President of Citizen Power Initiatives for China

Dr. Shannon Kroner Freedom of Religion – United Solutions